

Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 16, No. 370 (Dec. 1, 1873), p. 328

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3354457>

Accessed: 28-12-2015 00:21 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

so strong is habit, we are surprised to find under the title of "Jerusalem the golden" anything other than the "favourite and popular hymn" which has had an acceptance equal to that of any opera song, any dance, or any Christy Minstrel melody (tunefully speaking) that has permeated the streets of London. Now, in this case particularly, all the favour and popularity rests with the tune. It has been sung in places of worship of every denomination wherein English words are admissible—cathedrals, parish churches, and chapels of all kinds of nonconformists; it has been played on barrel organs throughout the length and breadth of the metropolis; it has been arranged as pianoforte Fantasias by several of the most fashionable writers for the instrument; and we feel that the mystical imagery of the poem to which it is set could not have been received to the extent it is by simple as much as gentle, but that it has been borne into favour by the popularity of the music. Others think otherwise; but our conviction is that the multiplication of tunes to one poem is injurious to hymnody, and tends to render its practice by congregations or other large bodies difficult, if not impossible. The excuse for a second setting of a well known poem is of course when one tune so entirely transcends the other in merit as to expel it from general use and obliterate it from general memory; such has been the case with Croft's fine tune to the 104th Psalm, which has entirely superseded the elder, also meritorious, tune to the same words. It is not to be expected that any of the settings in the collection before us will thus arrive at a supremacy above pre-existing popular favourites, and one may ask therefore what is their "right to be"? This right is clearly not proven by superior fitness to the words, in the new music to Lyte's poem "Abide with me," in which the weak syllable that begins each line, except the last, is set to the strongly accented first note of a bar, and in the last line of each stanza the fault is reversed, the accented syllable being set to a weak note. The said last line, which is the same in every stanza but one, has this curious reading, the musical accents being indicated by italics:—

Help of the helpless O abide with me.

there being no breathing place for the natural comma after "helpless;" and in the one excepted stanza, the sense is thus equally rendered ambiguous:—

O Thou who changest not, abide with me.

It would have been well had the leap of the bass been avoided, from the chord of $\frac{4}{4}$, between bars one and two, in No. 1; and again, in No. 4, if the B bass that closes line 4 had not been anticipated in the previous bar, and the rhythm had not been consequently confused. With these two exceptions, and with that of line 4 of No. 6, the music of the whole is charming, its melody graceful and its harmony a brightly coloured specimen of the modern style. The settings are scarcely appropriate for multitudinous singing, but with carefully trained choirs they will produce a most pleasing effect.

Little May's Musical Drawing Slate.

We can well imagine the horror of "Little May," who has been promised a "Drawing Slate" (for the prefix "Musical" may very likely be concealed until the last moment), and finds, on receiving it, that instead of the pretty trees, houses and sheep on which she resolved to concentrate her energy, she is expected to form all sorts of musical signs—to write the names of the notes, in and out of the staff, to put down the turn, shake, pause and the many other "things to be remembered" which accompany this most solemn toy. It is true that in the first page we have a floral device, with a large number of musical instruments scattered about—including a pianoforte, upon which the name of the firm, "Weekes and Co.," is prominently printed—but this little picture is only the gilding of the pill; and we much doubt whether the most good-humoured child in the world can be deluded into the belief that tracing the musical characters upon a transparent slate is "drawing." As a rule, we do not think that young people should ever be trained to receive instruction as amusement. When study is over, recreation may follow, but the two cannot be combined. Geography taught by "conversation cards," and the names and value of the notes by a "round game," may look very well in an advertisement; but at-

tempt to use either one or the other for its intended purpose, and it will inevitably result in a failure. "Little May's Musical Drawing Slate" is good of its kind. The lessons are well set, the exercises on the names of the notes, &c., are carefully arranged, and the printing is clear. We do not doubt that the system is faithfully carried out; we only doubt the soundness of the system itself.

R. LIMPUS.

"*The Lord is my portion.*" Anthem by F. E. Gladstone.

THE most interesting part of this piece is the first strain, which is given first by solo voices and repeated by the chorus. What follows, by far the larger part of the anthem, is correctly written, but has little attraction. A practice prevails throughout, in which the writer is by no means singular, but which still is open to question of its propriety. This is, the setting of a longer note to the second and unaccented syllable than to the first, in such words as "portion," "blossom," "olive," and the like, enforcing by syncopation the unnatural accent thus induced. Too many inferior singers pursue this practice with serious detriment to our greatly abused English language and to the vocal effect; but if it be incorrect, its use by singers justifies not its adoption by composers, who should rather give than take the rule in such matters. The only thing that can be defensively urged is that, in speech, we do not dwell on the first syllable of such words as are above quoted from the anthem, wherein the strongly accented first syllable has a short vowel. Admitting the truth of this, it must still be protested that we do not dwell either upon the second syllable when we speak, and that to do so when we sing distorts the word, gives often a stronger prominence to a short vowel in the one syllable than that which is avoided in the other, and gives a colour of truth to the else groundless assertion that ours is an unmusical language. It is less against good sound and pure sense, in such cases, to elongate the first than the second syllable in words of this formation, and it is practicable also in many cases to have a rest after the second syllable; either of these, or anything else, would be better than what we cannot but esteem as a vulgarism which it is the duty of the musical declaimer to correct. It is not here intended to place on the shoulders of the author of this Anthem all the burden of other folks' short-comings, executive and productive; the instances adduced from his work suggest the consideration now given to the subject; but many worse present themselves to the ears and eyes of all who listen to singing or read vocal music. The Anthem gained the five guinea prize of the College of Organists in 1870, and so comes before the world with strong credentials.

Andante, in A major, for the Organ, by F. E. Gladstone.

THIS is another of the prize pieces of the College of Organists, and the late organist of Chichester Cathedral is again the winner. Unluckily—for such things are always matters of luck and not of malice—it begins like a Russian melody which has been familiarised in this country by its employment in one of the earliest pieces of Thalberg for the pianoforte, and also by its inclusion in a violin fantasia of the late Ferdinand David that Herr Joachim used to play when he visited us as a boy and excited the wondering delight of all who heard him. There is abundant other matter in the present *Andante*, all of interest, and well disposed for the organ, which proves the graceful and cultivated mind of the author. Practice in writing, and the careful observation of the forms in which the masters of the art cast their thoughts, will improve the composer's command of the principles of plan, wherein this piece shows him to be defective.

WILLIAM MORLEY.

La Harpe Enchantée. Morceau de Salon, composed for the Pianoforte by F. V. Kornatzki.

HARP music for the Pianoforte, like Pianoforte music for the Harp, can scarcely perhaps be pronounced legitimate, but the public has to a certain extent accepted it; and where there is a demand, there is pretty certain to be a supply. This "Morceau" is so exceedingly like the